

DRAFT

**Boston Climate Action Planning Process
Community Workshops
Open-Ended Comments**

This document records the written comments offered by individuals at all five community workshops. The comments have been grouped by theme, not by workshop. They reflect the actual comments and have not been edited.

Table of Contents

Equity Concerns..... 2

Comments re: Mitigation Proposals..... 2

 Buildings (including financing) and renewable energy sources 2

 Parking 5

 Cars and driving..... 6

 Biking and Walking 7

 Public Transit 9

 Trash and Food Waste 10

 Recycling 12

 Open Space/Green Space 13

Comments re: Community Engagement Strategy..... 14

 Framing the Engagement Strategy..... 14

 Tools for Individuals to Act and Influence..... 15

 Neighborhood-based action 16

 Comments related to city government leading by example..... 20

Comments re: Workshop Feedback..... 21

Equity Concerns

Fairness of the design and implementation of programs:

- “Any measure has to be seen as fair.”
- “Don’t penalize people who have no alternative.” “It’s important that any penalties (trash, parking, heating) don’t unfairly target low income communities or individuals who don’t have the power or means to make changes (e.g., tenants who pay a fuel bill but don’t have the means/power to overhaul a house they don’t own).”
- Populations that could be unfairly affected by the programs: Low income people, working families, senior citizens, geographically isolated neighborhoods, people of color, people with respiratory illnesses who live near highways, handicapped people, tenants
- Programs called out for attention: oil surcharge, parking penalties and permit fees, pay as you throw

Fair access to economic opportunities:

- Access to training and jobs for neighborhood residents, regardless of race, language, immigration status, CORI status, non-union workers
- Strong job standards/worker protections
- More opportunities for local contractors and minority businesses

Comments re: Mitigation Proposals

Buildings (including financing) and renewable energy sources

Financing

- Pre-weatherization funds for people who needs work done before they can have their home weatherized
- Grants for alternative energy retrofits of homes
- Need up front financing for home weatherization/energy efficiency measures
- When homeowners perform energy efficiency upgrades to their homes, they have to pay the contractor as soon as the work is done. But then the rebate doesn’t arrive for weeks. Make rebate simultaneous with completing the work.
- Consideration of tax rebates or credits as incentives to install energy efficient improvements; Improve tax credits for solar panels, effective appliances, cars, etc.; City provides tax incentive/interest-free loans for upgrading energy efficiency
- On-bill financing for home retrofits; on-bill financing; on bill financing for retrofits
- Solar system-energy bond
- Get on PACE Bond financing (if it passes) in the Municipal Relief Act. PACE Boards are a great way to set building energy efficiency involvements implemented; Property tax financing (PACE)
- More on big businesses. What fees do they pay? To offset home fees...Corporations/buildings—Gillette; invite them to have meetings; their exhaust: pay fees/offset environmental damages

Technology

- ∞ Encourage use of smart grid technology to see and track energy use; Smart grid technology; Smart meters—get people better information on their energy usage more frequently, via their computer, etc.; Smart meters
- ∞ Thermal imaging every building via google; Create thermal map of all buildings in city; Program to buy infrared/heat loss cameras and loan out to homeowners
- ∞ Use MIT panels that change from liquid to solid by using a polymer that changes color of roof by temperature (Albedo)
- ∞ Build built-in wind turbine on large building for generating energy; buildings to channel wind into turbines; Put wind turbines in Cape and Boston; Make a wind farm – have a BU windmill, an MIT windmill, Harvard – just to get people excited about the idea
- ∞ For large multifamily buildings have better ways to control heat; people spoke of the experience of opening their windows of their apartment in the winter, because they couldn't control the heat, weatherize large apartments
- ∞ Renewable, [illegible] fuel systems
 - Use of technology (installing light sensors, timed heating controls, etc.)
 - Solar panels on buildings

Incentives

- Incentivize zero emissions
- Limit rental increases according to energy of dwelling; sort of like rent control but COL limited unless efficiency improvements make it better (e.g., in Quebec)
- Have renters pay for own heat so will use it more carefully
- Grants for lowered energy consumption; Pay people for their reductions? People can sell their green tags?
- Incentives to live near where you work
- Economic incentives for homeowners—tax breaks for specific time period
- Use stimulus money to give all renters energy efficient light bulbs, \$ off bills, energy monitors
- Incentives to businesses
- Laud buildings that have high efficiencies
- Green leases

Building codes

- ∞ Be more aggressive with codes (“stretch” code is not a stretch)
- ∞ Graywater city codes; Change building code to allow reuse of gray water in toilets
- Enforce green building codes; Better enforcement of building codes/green/LEED certifications
- I think building requirements are a really good idea
- Make policy and laws stricter for new things built (roads, houses and trains)

Audits

- Check for green buildings in home inspections and commercial inspections when health inspection is already taking place; Energy audits as part of health inspections

- Audits need to be much better. E.g., we had an audit May '09. No recommendations to do rim joist insulation on our 100 year old house. We need it. Now we have to wait 1 year, have another audit, etc. Waste of money. Important to get ideas from people who've had audits. Mary McCarthy/Liz Breadon have done major energy changes in 100 year old house in Brighton and are willing to share ideas and experiences in any way that would be useful.
- ◇ Free energy audits for home owners

Implementation

- ∞ Simplify home renovation efforts to improve energy efficiency (too many sources); Make it easier for landlords to work through the bureaucracy. Current system too hard.
- ∞ Info on building efficiency should come from utility, not burden home owner
- ∞ Homeworks and Renewal Boston work together to support energy upgrades to mod/low income homeowners
- ∞ RE: specific types of buildings:
 - Infrastructure/housing stock too old for some retrofits
 - Remove old/abandoned buildings and replace with more efficient ones
 - Helping to make older homes green, rather than focusing on new construction primarily
 - Improve building structures using more greenhouse gases
 - Expanding energy efficiency programs for large buildings
 - Commercial industrial buildings
 - Historical districts: Need help with barriers to making improvements; Increase efficiency of buildings—need to address historical [illegible] of maintaining appearance of buildings and the resultant inefficient buildings; I think working with historic commissions to make more energy efficiency changes easier to make would be effective; Problem operating 21st century institution in 19th century historic district (Back Bay). How to introduce new technologies that compete with aesthetics?
- ∞ Also highly visible projects would go a long way
- ∞ More affordable housing that's also green/efficient
- Home owners, renters, condos need to have very different implementation models/methods. Renters can't even put in efficient appliances. Condos have private waste haulers.

Outreach and Behavior Change

- Reach out to real estate brokers and large landlords—in neighborhoods like Allston, large number of big buildings are worst offenders. Landlords live far away. Can energy efficiency help, education, cost-sharing be extended to them? Reach out to landlords and large management companies; Need more focus on people/landlords saving money, protecting property value; Landlords can be good “gatekeepers” for green messaging—direct contact when come in to rent;
- How to promote energy efficiency among renters/students; Big transient/student community. Issues differ
- ∞ How about getting the utilities to be more innovative in terms of billing—show households how their energy use compares to a relevant peer group

- ∞ More emphasis on businesses to participate in addressing climate control.
- ∞ Shut off lights in buildings
- ∞ Outreach for energy audits; award ones who carry out audit/rebates
- ∞ Need better outreach efforts to inform both ordinary citizens and potential contractors

Energy Labeling

- I'm unsure about making it mandatory for all home owners to upgrade energy efficiency before selling their home, but I do think that all landlords should be required to make these upgrades. Tenants most often have to pay these bills and don't have control over making major changes. Landlords should be required to provide apartments and homes that meet energy efficiency standards.
- Energy labels for rental properties must be displayed with ad
- Label restaurants
- If properties had to be updated before sale, would be a burden on elderly and those who can't afford it. Maybe require improvement in the course of transaction—either seller or buyer.
- Energy rating and labeling needs to be done carefully given the age and range of housing stock; comparable stock should be grouped and compared to each other; for ratings below targets, there should be technical assistance and other incentives to improve
- Certification of apartments as green—competitive advantage in rental market; you pay less for electric

Other

- Regulation of private contractors; Need some system of regulating contractors
- Reserve energy contracts for small businesses (< \$100,000)
- Would they be concerned if there is a bad grading system?
- Keeping houses insulated from the heat is important
- Issue: getting large building landlord to help implement NStar audit result for all 780 apartment units

Parking

- Parking permits:
 - Reduce parking permit fees for hybrids
 - Parking permit by gross vehicle weight or MPG; lower it/discount for more efficient
 - I own my condo in Allston and sold my car when I moved into Boston. I would love to be able to buy a visitors permit for people coming to visit me in my neighborhood. If they could come and park and not have to keep moving their car, it would be great! And create some revenue.
 - Residential parking permits penalizes working families; should not do that without drastic improvement in public transit with reduction in cost
 - Increase the parking fares will not really encourage people to start using the MBTA because a few dollars will not be that much
 - No to residential permit fees
 - Confused about parking sticker prices. \$1500 is too high.

- How much for permits? Are these just for high density areas that have existing permit issues or everywhere across the board?
- Don't agree with parking thing. If people have to pay more for parking they will just drive around the block, creating more carbon emissions
- The parking ban or extra charging was unpopular for distant commuters who don't have public trans or other options
- Instead of parking fees, try to lower bus/train transportation and lower costs of bikes
- Earmark fees (meters) to advance climate change – cynicism; Curious about what profit from parking and other fees will be directed towards
- Re: Parking lots/garages
 - ∞ Incentives for car sharing/parking spaces in municipal lots
 - ∞ City should own public parking lots so can raise price for all parking downtown
 - ∞ Parking pricing with congestion rings (like London)
 - ❖ White parking lots vs. black tar—cooler by day, less light by night
 - ❖ More trees in parking lots
 - ❖ Restricting on parking lots won't work
 - ❖ Limit parking garages to get more suburban commuters to use public transport
- ◇ Ticket cars parking in bike lanes

Cars and driving

- Make process to get license the same/just as hard for adults as it is for youth
- Financial Incentives
 - Make hybrids cheaper
 - Free ride service to medical, church, grocery store, so people don't need to own cars
 - Underwrite use of Peapod (grocery delivery service) for homes that do not own cars
- Financial disincentives
 - Tolls in city center; surcharge on cars driving into Boston; congestion pricing; Tax as you drive/enter city
 - Gas tax is better than permit fee; Increase gas prices
 - Make cars uglier and more expensive
- This proposal underestimates savings from transportation. Programs in the city could include congestion fees for drivers and programs to increase access and service on the MBTA without increasing the cost to T riders
- Cars can run on excess restaurant grease
- Car sharing:
 - Use social networking to enhance car sharing—an “ap” for that
 - Car sharing (easy use); Zip Cars are good
 - Car sharing – why will you promote to car pool for people instead of walking or taking public transportation?
 - Need more Zip Cars in minority areas. I see them only at T and white areas!! How help Zip Car make policy change!... Zip car idea—some neighborhoods seem to

have less current users—in Brighton, could usually get a car on short notice but in JP/South End it's harder. So maybe when considering ¼ mile goal, work with company around neighborhoods with higher numbers of users.

- If neighbors know each other—car sharing
- Build infrastructure that would accommodate electric cars; Transportation – climate mitigation behavior changes: electric cars were not considered as a possible solution for mitigating GHG emissions and should be considered and explored; Boston should help promote development of electric vehicle infrastructure – public/workplace/home charging, electrical and building codes to facilitate charging; Boston needs to better promote and incentivize City residents and commuters to get and use plug in hybrid and electric vehicles (fee-bates, preferred parking, charging stations all over town, etc.)
- Outlaw drive-ins [drive-through?] in Boston!
- ∞ Close roads running through Franklin Park every Sunday (like closing Memorial Drive) to promote safe biking, etc.
- ∞ Rotaries in cross streets (like Seattle)
- ∞ Suggestion to ban trucks from center of city and certain areas, modeled after Paris, other cities
- ∞ Behavior change strategies:
 - We should focus on how people use cars instead of using unrealistic goal because cars are always going to be around
 - Adopt a weekly “no driving day” so people can experience the silence (ditto for “lights out day”); “Car free” days; Have occasional “car free” days/parts of days
 - Weekly telecommuting days/flex hours
 - Start and/or underwrite community day care centers that parents can walk their children to
 - Ask “What would help you not to drive?”
 - Remember... cares = power; license = status and freedom
- ❖ Laws to stop idling of cars
- ◇ Fuel efficient gas stations
- ◇ How do we dispose hybrid car batteries?

Biking and Walking

Infrastructure and safety

- Places to shower after biking = extremely unhygienic. MRSA infections?
- Secure bike racks/cages in the parks, at T stations, on busses and trains, schools
- Bike storage in all rental apartment buildings
- Expanded sidewalks, more walkable and bikes
- Safe and separated bike lanes
- Coordinate with DCR to close gaps in bike network, also within the city connect the bike lanes
- To make bike paths work better, bikers should be more regulated
- Put troopers and police on bikes ticketing bikers
- Bike lanes aren't always where you're going
- 10 miles a year for additional bike lanes is not enough; expand bike lanes
- Cut down speeds of cars and make safer for pedestrian and cars
- Streets just for bikes—close Storrow Drive; Close some roads to bikes only

- Walking/biking paths between different regions
- Install better bike lanes (lanes that are better marked, raised, separated from traffic)
- Safer biking; Safe bike paths; enforce bike safety laws for drivers
- Concerns about safety, theft, requests for safer lanes inside the parking rows between sidewalk and cars
- Education for biker riders and drivers; put bike questions into license tests, etc
- Cars not educated on bikers

Implementation

- Many concerns about bikes just being stolen/not returned; Bikes – theft? Vandalism? Color, kind of bike could help
- ∞ Coop with Cambridge for bike sharing
- ◇ Zip bike—members have a key. Bikes are around Boston. (Key prevents theft.) Or a kind of library card that you swipe. Would need a grocery basket or tricycle for the elderly.

Jobs

- Youth jobs—bike maintenance

Behavior change

- Promote walking as exercise
- Biking should be a high priority in Boston because we could do so much more to increase participation
- I think biking should be a big part in going green. A lot of the time riding a bike is faster than taking the bus and you aren't polluting the air. It is also healthier than taking the bus or train. Women who bike/walk 30 minutes a day have a reduced chance of getting breast cancer. (actual statistic) In certain areas of Boston people don't have easy access to the T so bike is a healthy and cost efficient way to get around Boston. There is only one problem bikers face—there aren't many bike lanes so it is dangerous to ride in the street. Most people don't realize that biking is illegal after age 12 (or 13) to ride on the sidewalk.
- Bike system during summer is good
- Bike and see how easy it is to ride a bike on a particular [route]
- Ride bikes because you like to, not because someone tells you to (This applies to all environmental changes)
- Promoting bike usage
- Make it “cool” to ride bikes
- On biking- cynicism, “people won't do bike shares. It won't happen as a form of commuting.”

Incentives

- No tax on bike purchases; No tax on bike purchased

Types of bikes

- Battery powered bikes
- Folding bikes that can be carried around instead of locked up

Equity considerations

- Bike programs for youth who can't ride a bike (city-sponsored)
- In East Boston, we have no way to get to Boston by bike
- Bike sharing in the neighborhoods at public housing
- Biking – does this apply to low income community as well?

Public Transit

Supporting Transit Use

- MBTA needs major improvements (lower fares, more service, more reliability) before people can be encouraged to take it instead of drive. It's unreasonable to ask people to use an ineffective and unreliable system.
- People will not take public transit or bike unless they feel it is faster, cheaper and more convenient than driving. In many cases, it already is, but people don't believe that's the case.
- Why increase prices for trash disposal and permit stickers in low income neighborhoods while you can decrease public transportation costs. The fare for the MBTA is what prevents many Bostonians from using mass transit. Lowering fees would encourage green living, not increasing fees.

Expand and improve service

- Greater transportation access and improve connections to all parts of cities, regional model across cities. MBTA needs assistance; Faster completion of expanding/connecting the T
- Improve inter-neighborhood bus service; Revise T so is a wheel and spoke to improve neighborhood connectivity
- Light rail or underground rail service needed in all neighborhoods. Big gap in Roxbury and parts of Dorchester. Bus riding is unpleasant in this city in every way. Irregular service, crowded, etc.
- More rapid transit in low income neighborhoods, which experience more transit traffic and therefore more pollution... The Silver Line was not equal or better!
- Extend hours of the T; later hours so don't need to take cab late at night
- Too much traffic in MBTA system
- Regulate T-emission levels
- Make public transit more efficient and predictable
- Give B line priority
- Water transport—electric boats and/or alternative fuels
- Electric buses powered by renewable energy

Reduce fares

- Have all commuter rail service costs in Boston neighborhoods equal to bus/subway T pass
- Why increase prices for trash disposal and permit stickers in low income neighborhoods while you can decrease public transportation costs. The fare for the MBTA is what prevents many Bostonians from using mass transit. Lowering fees would encourage green living, not increasing fees.

- Transportation is also really important. More funding should go to the MBTA so that they can make it cheaper and better.
- Use some of the funds from increased parking to discount cost for student transportation
- Why pay more for MBTA? I remember when we paid 50 cents
- Improve/lower prices for MBTA
- Family rate on mass transit. When you take the whole family (2 adults and teenagers) it is cheaper to drive into Boston. How can we change it?
- More free T days to bring in new riders
- Offer incentives for using transit – e.g., 1 free ride after 10 paid rides

Equity

- ∞ Big concern on affect on the poor. Those with early morning jobs don't have ability to get to work on the T, or to cross the spokes to get from job to job

Other

- ❖ Reduce harassment of youth by MBTA police
- ❖ Eliminate bussing of school children in Boston and promote safe routes to school within the city by improving pedestrian and bike facilities and create neighborhood schools; Go back to neighborhood schools – reduce busing
- ◇ More subsidies for transit
- ◇ Portland, OR has an automated system that users can call (with stop ID) to find out the next bus times—if @ bus stop, is great for deciding to walk/wait
- ◇ “Gypsy cabs” should be legalized; other drivers cheaper than cabs

Trash and Food Waste

- Many comments that the first bag/barrel or two should be free to discourage dumping
 - Many concerned about dumping in parks, woods, river/harbor, roadside, etc.
 - Don't charge for trash because people would just dump their trash at parks instead of paying; throwing trash into Franklin Park
 - First bag or two for free
 - Charging will encourage people to dump their trash in river/harbor, side of road, etc.
 - How to avoid people throwing non-recyclable waste into recycling bin to avoid potential costs, especially in apartment complexes and condos
 - Doesn't work to pay for mix trash; No to \$/trash bag. Not in this neighborhood! (Dudley); Participants at this table are concerned about pay-as-you-throw program that imposes fee on trash. In where they live, although charged with the same taxes, they are not receiving the same city services. For example, there are not even enough trash bins on the street. It seems unfair to charge these underserved people fees.
- ∞ Do not institute “pay as you throw” for trash. I fear we will have Fowl Meadow and other parklands become an illegal dumping ground. We already have Milton residents dumping at Camp Meigs, Fowl Meadow and the Kennedy Playground.
- ❖ Pay as you throw—no way to monitor, encourages dumping

- ❖ If adopt pay-as-you-throw, need to control dumping, particularly in bad neighborhoods (e.g. Mattapan) Pay-as-you-throw sounds like a good way to reduce waste
- ❖ Pay as you throw-good idea but needs rethinking/work in terms of implementation (What about people commuting in? trash? What if neighbors toss in your yard?)
 - Inspect all parts of the city for trash
 - Education process needs to happen before you can even begin to charge people. They won't understand why this policy exists. You need to raise awareness first. Especially true for residents who don't speak English. They tend to be more out of touch with the green movement.
 - Reduce waste
 - Packaging ordinance to prohibit excess packaging; Adopt measures to reduce waste/packaging; Mandate that products sold in Boston are not highly packaged (analogous to NY's ban on trans fats in foods); There should be laws that restrict packaging that come into the city from distributors- less packaging, less waste (ideas have been submitted to the city for all restaurants to join the GRA- Green Restaurant Association, which requires more sustainable packaging. Suggestions to make this happen.)
 - Charge for disposable utensils, cups, etc and other measures to reduce waste.
 - Work with businesses like Dunkin Donuts to have business incentives not to sell Styrofoam cups!! Away with coffee cups.
 - Fee for plastic bags
- ∞ Trash pick up: More trash cans; City has to have a sustained effort-trash pick up and recycling pick up; Trash pick up from community gardens, community parties, meetings
- ◇ Please take a look at biochar for dealing with yard waste—it is carbon negative and improves the soil. Much better than just biomass
- Food Waste
 - Municipal composting should find ways for residents to get compost back for personal use, community garden use, etc. Composting – Why can't we have a central place to donate compost to put towards community planting?; Compost: great idea! And especially if it could then be available to residents for home gardening, etc. Encourage gardening! Methane from composting; Rodent-proof large compost bins
 - Link separating food waste with pay-as-you-throw
 - Where is urban agriculture (and this ties in with compost/food scraps); Food/agriculture-promoting local food, urban agriculture, low energy agriculture; Encourage front yard gardens and local agriculture
 - Increase community gardens and improve the quality of current/existing gardens. This will decrease GHG in transport and decrease the amount of packing/solid waste.; one community garden for every community
 - Establish community food gardens in empty lots/roofs
 - Converting city properties to community gardens
 - Gardening to reduce transit required for groceries. Tie in with composting from separating food waste
 - Add community gardens; support organizations like Boston Natural Areas Network (training urban gardeners); citywide education to garden

- Community gardens: “your compost at work” – and turn it into energy – or dividends on recyclables – also free stuff at the dump.
- More urban gardening
- Why no initiative for gardening and for converting lawns to organic gardens? Local food production lowers transportation costs and means cheaper, fresher food
- Develop rain gardens

Recycling

- Create permanent neighborhood residential toxic drop-off centers in vacant storefronts (batteries, paint, TVs, computers, etc.); Are there more convenient ways to dispose light bulbs, batteries, etc.?
- ❖ Food businesses recycling; Green catering programs
- Public recycling bins everywhere; make recycling as common in society as not littering
 - Public recycling bins on street; Recycle bins next to trash cans; more recycle bins on the streets of Boston; Recycling containers in major urban areas –Newbury St.; Street recycling mandatory
 - Recycling options in Mass Transit other than paper; Public access to recycling should increase; for example, there is paper recycling in T stations but there isn’t bottle and can recycling
 - Recycling bins in all city parks
 - Make recycling easier; billboards, public notices. A lot of people don’t know how to recycle or where to get a recycling bin; make recycling just as easy as wasting
- Make recycling mandatory in:
 - ∞ Apartments recycling mandatory; Mandate recycling in large apartment complexes
 - More schools should have recycle bins for paper, plastic and especially food; school-based recycling; School recycling program; School and apartment complex recycling pick up
 - ❖ Recycling requirements for businesses; Pick up recycling from businesses
 - ❖ Get the little bin for your personal use inside so when you take the trash out take recycle out
 - ❖ How enforce schools/community health centers/multi-unit apartments have own private trash pick up. Do they recycle?
- Incentives
 - The people who recycle the most get a free week of trash
 - Incentives (refund for bin of recycling)
 - Give money for putting out recycling bins so people have incentives to recycle
 - Weigh recycling—points for discounts in grocery stores
- More recycling facilities
- Require manufacturers to pay cost of recycling their products (e.g. European Union)
- More vendors accepting bottles/cans
- Have separate garbage trucks for recycling and garbage
- Enforcement of trash and recycling

- ◇ Educate people about recycling, students educate their parents, necessary to change behaviors; teach rather than pamphlets; 10 step program for recycling-implement; Recycling education (more than pamphlets); Homeowner education for recycling; Teach and promote recycling, reusing and composting in schools. Do it, collect it (collect compost and recycling) in schools and apartments; Recycle more and publicize it more, educate more—extend recycling to apartments, schools;
- ◇ Recycle plastics
- ◇ Throw recycling into one bin is good because it is less time consuming and it creates jobs for people to sort the recycling; show people the by-products of recycled materials and explain how it contributes to more jobs

Open Space/Green Space

Community gardens

- Increase community gardens and improve the quality of current/existing gardens. This will decrease GHG in transport and decrease the amount of packing/solid waste.; one community garden for every community
- Establish community food gardens in empty lots/roofs
- Converting city properties to community gardens
- Gardening to reduce transit required for groceries. Tie in with composting from separating food waste
- Add community gardens; support organizations like Boston Natural Areas Network (training urban gardeners); citywide education to garden
- Community gardens: “your compost at work” – and turn it into energy – or dividends on recyclables – also free stuff at the dump.
- More urban gardening
- Why no initiative for gardening and for converting lawns to organic gardens? Local food production lowers transportation costs and means cheaper, fresher food
- Develop rain gardens

Promote local food economy

- Eliminate barriers to grow and sell local produce
- Community garden/year round farmers market; Promoting more gardens, especially on flat roofs; give more support to local gardens e.g., the Food Project
- Increase local food production
- Re-evaluate prohibitions on chickens in yards. Local egg production yields fresh, local eggs and connection to the earth, environment, food production, etc.
- Re-evaluation of policies of keeping animals (like chickens) on properties... community livestock properties like community gardens

More green roofs and tree planting

- Get businesses to green their flat roofs. This will: help prevent flooding; reduce carbon and CO²
- More vegetative roofs to grow things to eat

Trees help clean the air; tree cover/green spaces

- Require developers to replace trees/shrubs that they cut down or include them in their projects
- Increase tree planting
- Plant large trees in Boston
- Tree education
- Should require permit to take down a tree; should replace any tree you take down
- Tree adoption programs to encourage tree survival/green canopy
- Incentives to plant and keep trees; Plant fruit trees; what about parks, trees and green space?
- Heat! Lack of access to trees, green space, beach, nature. Concrete jungle. Leads to violence

Green space/open space

- More public spaces where neighborhoods can build community; open space to congregate/build community; More parks as public green spaces and community builders
- Be brave about land use. We need urban waterfront sites for constructed wetlands to mitigate storm surge. We need secondary urban sites for city-owned and city-developed solar power facilities. (stay with the DG collaborative)
- Measures to address black topping of green areas to rent out as parking spaces
- Green fences instead of wire/metal (like hedges)
- Increase wildlife habitat = pollinators/butterfly gardens

Nutrition/eating Education

- Home economics in school promoting sustainability/eating locally/good nutrition
- Seasonal eating education/canning reduce need for food shipping
- Promote vegetarianism to reduce global impact from animals

Comments re: Community Engagement Strategy

Framing the Engagement Strategy

Incentives vs. coercion

- Benefits-based approach—benefits to issues that groups/people care about —not penalties or punishment; Cost benefit analysis; facts as incentive
- Depends on voluntary; don't force it with them; not come off as authoritative; education is key
- Do not “mandate” change because it's off-putting; incentivize it so people will adopt.
- Ride bikes because you like to, not because someone tells you to (This applies to all environmental changes)
- The message needs to be positive- providing stability, security, jobs; Climate change is not first priority for most people- make it about jobs and security

Or

- Need more education!! Education about choices before enforcement; Need to start at the source of the problem, not punish people for what they don't understand (i.e., discussion of tickets for parking, and pay as you throw violations)
- More incentives than sticks
- Provide incentives for early adoption of energy efficiency measures, which eventually morphs into fee/tax for non-use (inform people that this is the way it will work) (note: country of Greece does this with solar)

Or

- Needs to be intentional/coercive
- Have consequences for not being energy efficient or environmentally friendly
- Public shaming/moral or monetary value to behaviors

Add to broad framing

- Integrate new ideas with our every day things
- Need to speak to “what’s in it for me?”; Make it personal – about them
- Start realistic; Importance of having ways to get involved that don’t involve big commitment→instant, easy, not jumping off a cliff
- Dovetail the adaptation with mitigation
- Convenience to encourage people to live greener
- How can we help our teenagers in a way that doesn’t affect our “teenage” life?
- Make everything fun and entertaining, less gloom and doom
- Educate – stats/how bad it will be; what people see as the issues; focus on that
- Balance sense of urgency with empowerment; Hopelessness. Can one person have any effect?
- Team sports—that we have to work together as a team
- Problem with the word “emissions” as in Greenhouse Gas Emissions. Not always emissions, but rather “contributions.”

Other comments

- We should spend as much time as we do with small ideas to trying to change big companies’ effect on this problem
- The city has to be careful not to use this as a way to just raise fees, meters and trash collection or people will feel ripped off and not supportive
- No greenwashing!! [pretending products or processes are environmentally friendly when they are not]

Tools for Individuals to Act and Influence

Ideas for action, such as:

- Coupons to farmer’s markets, cooking classes, bike + T discounts, info DVD, seeds
- Eating less meat
- Increase internet accessibility to reduce paper consumption
- Local opportunities to avoid travel for shopping, etc.

Information

- Green hotline run by the city to answer questions
- Information about financing options, feasibility and benefits of different actions,
- Resources you trust: energy auditors, contractors who are certified to do EE work and who have track records in specific neighborhoods
- Calculating energy consumption, percentage from renewables, carbon footprint
- Community based websites re: energy use reporting, recycling, etc.
- Actual persistent exposure to role models or practice in the behavior; particularly respected individuals

Neighborhood-based action

Affirmation of things we have already discussed

- Focusing on targeting communities as one, not individual people, because single people will feel threatened and probably not respond the way that was intended
- Actual persistent exposure to role models or practice the behavior; particularly respected individuals We have to show an effective way of how change can/is happening. Make it fun.
- More helping hands
- Sense of community (helping each other)
- More work is done
- Get out to every neighborhood

Developing and implementing the work

- Neighborhood committee meeting; neighborhood networks; Community agency; Neighborhood-based action: strengthen or create neighborhood task force; Leverage community groups that already exist to:
 - I think teen-adult neighborhood group needs to be given resources to assess and select projects! Versus top down; Gives people more discussion time which leads to new ideas; Consensus (gives better understanding of community wants); Use the nonprofit network ongoing participation for discussions; Use network of non-profits to tap into connection with people to take ownership of the community—create effective strategy to utilize strength of non-profits and civic action groups to tap into people who live within community. Education; Neighborhoods have ideas. Use them!
 - Grassroots organization
 - Train eco teams in every neighborhood to work with the neighbors; Help to neighborhood organizations making outreach efforts
 - Community involvement in enforcing/implicating policies
- Mentoring/partnering to coach and teach adults on environmental partnering and conservation of resources. They pass it on after a short-term commitment, more to or pass forward to mentor someone else. That is how they move to the next level. It needs to be made visceral, touch the senses; Neighbor to neighbor “coaches” to share and inspire people to go through the experience of green projects
- Neighborhood-based action-have them be paid jobs; Get funding for neighborhood organizing- it’s essential. Creates community using word of mouth, networks of people

become a teaching tool that educate others; Have the monies more available to the community by being accessible in the community

- Need contact with city liaisons; There needs to be a connector and a bridge between the city government and the neighborhood groups and organizers
- Neighborhood green centers: technical assistance; info on \$, programs; idea center; certified neighborhood contractors, etc.; launch site for new programs; Use schools and churches as locations for organizing bike share, car share, home energy workshops; Let schools, churches get grants to be bike centers. They do maintenance, etc.
- Collaborate with: Involve Main Streets programs; Use Housing Authority and Main Streets programs to educate neighbor for neighbor; Work with the Children's Museum, Museum of Science, etc.; Use local libraries for the local conversation about how to green Boston

Outreach to specific groups

- What is a community? What geographic neighborhoods can we tap into?
- Encourage communities of all demographics. For example, I know that the Chinese-American community in Boston is not very environmentally aware and there's been no internal effort to really change this behavior. I know that there are certain individuals—often in leadership positions in the community/social aspects of Chinese-American Boston—who have a lot of influence. If efforts were made to engage those individuals, the change they would effect by example would be immense.
- Need to deal with climate deniers
- People get discouraged when they see people wasting energy (idling cars, opening doors with AC on, huge SUVs, very leaky buildings). Makes them feel their own efforts are undercut. Part of the community engagement strategy should help target the energy wasters in the neighborhood or deal with this issue
- Don't just target neighborhoods; people have other affiliations: church, profession, etc. for example:
 - Faith-based outreach
 - If immigrants are not accounted for, we are not able to be active participants; there has been lack of information to the immigrants
 - Effect elders
 - College Students: There needs to be MORE STUDENT INVOLVEMENT and discussion with transient residents who are a large population; Students represent over 150,000 people in Boston; some outreach must be made to our college-age population (there were about a dozen BU students in the audience; if there had been outreach to college students, we may have had three dozen students from BU); Students are left out of the targeting; Integrate colleges/university into climate planning discussions; direct outreach to students also
 - Businesses: Lead by example at local business level (e.g. public recycling) where info disseminated; use barometers to show progress; Have businesses support climate action; Pizza shops – bank/plaza/stop&shop; Business and constituents to community meeting; Connect local neighborhood businesses with residents and green issues; Partnering with any businesses a display or handout, i.e. something visible “renew” or “greening Boston.” For example, exec of a bank on Saturday or in Post Office on Saturday, giving a free light bulb ad learning materials.

- Neighborhood-based action should include programs based at universities and other large institutions
- Children and teens:
 - I also feel that if we got more kids involved like in after school activities they will be more responsive to help. For example they should plant trees or flowers in their community.
 - Kids→parents→co-workers→community change!
 - During school hours?
 - Resources at the end for contributing to excite youth
 - Get beyond youth who are in organizations
 - We should also raise more awareness because when I look around only people that are in organizations are here. No one really came willingly from the community.
 - Most teens that are involved are in organizations
 - The children should be educated to respect the environment and how to plant trees. Not worship nature.

School-based ideas

- Add environmental justice elective at BPS – make available to all grades
- Establish programs/classes in schools to plant around school community in exchange for classes, like Latin, for example
- Not just science curriculum. Sustainability should be incorporated across the curriculum.
- Add a greenhouse to every school
- Conservation class should be mandatory (controversial)
- Need charismatic teachers who care passionately and are well-informed about climate change
- Encourage city’s higher ed institutions to participate with K -12 programs and orgs to inspire and empower youth and increase resource availability for these programs
- Encourage creation of “roots to shoots” (Jane Goodall’s organization) clubs to encourage youth involvement (ditto with participation in “global challenge award” and other existing programs)
- Incorporate climate action into lessons

Many ideas for specific activities and events (some new, some have been discussed)

Community events

- Cook outs, youth performances; My friends don’t care about it – cookouts – events – games – e.g. roots + shoots: “recycling for change” game show; Community events! Hand out info, inform people on easy lifestyle changes to live greener, give out free stuff (light bulbs, plants, tote bags); more community based activities for youth and adults; Block parties or school parties (have games that deal with environment); Petitions → raffles, competitions → more farmers markets; Community events: hand out info, inform people on easy lifestyle changes to live greener; give out free stuff (light bulbs? Plants? Tote bags?)
- Fundraisers, like basketball games

- Sports events
- For Eastie – Boat Tour – in 2050 this'll be under water
- Awards ceremony
- Walks for climate action
- Hold a pilot to show benefits of weatherization to everybody
- Organize regular green fests (On Sundays = “green laws” = day of rest)
- Face to face time equally important as online time
- Using neighborhood and community strategies very important: Examples cited- Roslindale, cool JP
- Have house parties, green block parties, skill shares, make it fun and practical, build community at the same time
- City-wide concert

- Community meetings – interactive things; Community programs to educate youth and citizens to help recycling (at schools, etc.); people don't understand green concepts; community meetings; interactive things; basic education
- Workshops
- Get people to talk about the issues – free food to get people to come; Free food at the workshops → promote community service jobs (greenway)
- Make the workshops and events more entertaining
- Hold community meetings to explain effects of global warming and how to take action, apply for energy efficiency programs; work with neighborhood groups to do this
- Video had error. Melting of floating icebergs does not contribute to higher sea level. Otherwise, video was excellent and should be screened at churches and libraries throughout Boston.
- Individual/community action could be supported more with kits/materials/info to share with neighbors
- Showcase energy efficiency measures and other green features during annual neighborhood house tours; consider a special house tour for this purpose; neighborhood tours of successful efficiency improvements
- Integrating issue into existing communities (e.g., churches, schools, community health centers, libraries); For community engagement, take advantage of schools, parent open houses, church fairs, neighborhood watch groups
- Interactive forums to facilitate info sharing/problem solving
- Wish to have more informative meetings on “how to” make home more energy efficient; Offer “how to courses” explaining what can be done by homeowners versus a contractor.
- Home owner courses
- Localizing programs
- Make spaces to engage with each other, more community conversations, community forums for people
- Use farmer's market, social networking, Low Carbon Diet book groups, churches, door to door
- Better dissemination of information and education
- Active education and partnerships with churches and other places of worship
- Doesn't work –passing out material with incentives
- Allow neighborhoods to plant trees

- Utilize existing events/conventions
- Community rewards for energy efficiency

Community and citywide competitions

- Which school/org/neighborhood can get highest % of community to act on some EE measure
- Have a competition among neighborhoods to see which one can reduce energy use the most; A city-wide “Olympics” to be the most green
- National Olympics for cities to see what city can be the most green – winner gets national recognition prize
- There should be competitions between neighborhoods, like an Olympics
- Friendly competition within sectors (church, school, gardens, etc.) with no losers—everyone gets an incentive

Mobile activities

- Mobile trucks showing how recycling works and the products made; the people should wear t-shirts and publicize at MBTA stations
- Door knocking – give info on tool kits – better than [?], esp when young people go knocking; Support door-to-door surveys of energy needs
- Word of mouth can be most effective in some neighborhoods; Face to face outreach—not internet
- Please prioritize block-by-block organizing and empowering neighborhood organizations and institutions to do outreach and education. Marketing will only get us so far

Visible images

- Murals, youth art/mural; Murals to illustrate the effects of climate change; Murals: illustrate effects of climate change (possible sea level...)
- Logos on t-shirts

Comments related to city government leading by example¹

Overall

- City needs to lead by example; Have the government lead by example to implement a city wide education and training/media campaign along with community involvement for jobs; Yes!! Let the city figure out how/what works and doesn't, change behaviors and attitudes
- Government shouldn't lead, government should assist

Staff behavior changes

- Enforce city workers to represent what they speak for (e.g., at my school, teachers talk about being green but drive large cars to school)
- Better enforcement of anti-idling law – esp. city vehicles
- Give city employees time off for EE work—staying home to get an audit, like time off now for cancer screening = 4 hours

¹ Note: The discussion of city buildings, vehicles and land are discussed in the mitigation chapter, not the community engagement chapter.

Buildings

- Decentralize heating/energy for schools and municipal buildings
- All government buildings should have solar panels – e.g. schools on hills

Vehicles

- Hybrid or energy-efficient trash/recycle vehicles – make it mandatory if they want the contract!

Waste management

- School recycling programs; Boston schools need to recycle plastic and food waste
- All city events (e.g., workshops, etc.) carbon neutral, food composted, recycling

Open space

- Create more green space in the city (city hall plaza, e.g.!)
- Use city-land to create permanent community gardens in the city for urban gardening!

Other

- Energy efficient street lighting city-wide
- Treadmills/bikes in school classrooms instead of stationary desks
- City should address water issues along with the energy/climate; it's critical to have an understanding about this nexus; water withdrawal uses lots of energy
- Improved level of information; also needs to come from the “right” (i.e., trusted) source in order to be effective

Comments re: Workshop Feedback

Re: policies/programs

- I really liked how certain new buildings have to be at a certain expectation like the roots and the energy and stuff like that; I really like the slide show too' some things really surprised me like the water rising
- At my table for the first discussion there was both a lot of support AND a lot of concern about the policies/programs presented. And there a lot of frustration during the polling when the questions were overly simplistic, asking only do you support/not support each one— when the answer is often, Yes, but only if _____ (e.g., tenant rights are protected).
- Put \$80 million in context of how much is currently being spent
- Dovetail the adaptation with mitigation- discussion alarming due to lack of discussion of adaptation strategies

Re: workshop design

- Good job guys!
- The value involved in bringing people together in workshops, in my opinion, will be most visible after people have had the chance to go home and speak to their friends and family, so thank you and keep up the efforts; we need all parties to engage in conversation around efforts, small and large, to mitigate the effects of climate change

- Very impressed with depth of thought and planning that has gone into this. If this project doesn't move forward it's not your fault.
- People felt the workshop imposed solutions on them rather than really asking for their opinion. (The questions were not questions but rather lip service—the city has already made up its mind what to do and now they are just checking in/testing the political waters.
- Explaining the process used to arrive at the solutions may have helped, and one participant suggested exploratory meetings in neighborhoods that were well-advertised so that the audience is representative.
- Need to be heard, more of a dialogue when asked what may have helped in terms of improving the feeling that things are being imposed, change/reframe: “What do you think of x?” “What do you need/think will work?” The facilitations were important because people felt they were the only time they were heard.

Re: polling options

- Also I believe teens should have led the PowerPoint and voting – let the youth really lead
- When reporting results of polls with range of opinion – lump 1-3 and 4-6 rather than (or in addition to) top vote-getters
- At my table people felt they would have liked a choice “none of the above” e.g. for bike options
- Re: question #22 (zip car) doesn't have a choice if you don't drive
- I'm concerned the poll is not accurate because it does not analyze the votes by age and financial circumstances
- Question 48—recommend using the word “persuade” not “make” (people take certain actions)
- Questions were too lengthy; Scale it down

Corrections

- Video had error. Melting of floating icebergs does not contribute to higher sea level. Otherwise, video was excellent and should be screened at churches and libraries throughout Boston.
- Typo on slide in second presentation – targetted instead of targeted

Questions/clarification needed

- Green lease-what is included?
- Save energy costs/audit?
- #44 polling question I didn't understand
- What are green collar jobs?
- Didn't explain oil/propane program
- I want more explanation about pay-as-you-throw and bike-sharing/bike-cabs

Requests

- Send email reminding when report is issued

Re: outreach and participation

- Chinatown?? Have a discussion there; it is not in the list

- Why there are not many immigrants coming to these sessions? Who's doing the outreach? What media channels are being used?
- Why is there only 1 workshop in a low income community?
- Having people from Roxbury host it instead of bringing people from other communities. Have them own it.

Other

- Compost and recycle at these workshops
- Please use recyclable plates and have recycling bins available
- For your next community event, please use plates and plasticware that can be composted with the food
- Why are we using so much plastic bottles tonight? Irony! Example; No bottled water please
- Still drilling